

**National Defense University
named after the First President of the Republic of Kazakhstan - Elbasy**

Lukmanov Robert Nikolaevich

**HISTORY OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE OMBUDSMAN
INSTITUTION AND PROSPECTS FOR ITS IMPLEMENTATION IN
THE ARMED FORCES OF THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN**

By specialty 8D12102 - Military history

Abstract

thesis for the academic degree
Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

Scientific advisers:

Doctor of historical sciences, professor Mukhamedzhanova S.Sh.

Candidate of military sciences, Associate Professor Martynov A.A.

Nur-Sultan, 2022

The relevance of the choice of research topic: **"History of the development of the ombudsman institution and prospects for its implementation in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan»** is due to:

firstly, the increasing importance in modern society of theoretical and practical issues of introducing extrajudicial mechanisms for protecting the rights of a citizen, which includes the political and legal institution of the ombudsman;

secondly, further political and legal modernization in the Republic of Kazakhstan, requiring special attention to the institution of the ombudsman, strengthening its role in the political and legal system of the country;

thirdly, the trend of the increasing use of specialized ombudsmen in various sectors and spheres of social and political life;

fourthly, solving the problems of proper management of military human resource management bodies and achieving observance of the constitutional rights of all categories of personnel and civilian personnel of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan;

fifthly, the obligations of the Republic of Kazakhstan at the international level in the field of military security, in particular, the adoption of the "Code of Conduct Concerning the Military-Political Aspects of Security" and the participation of representatives of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan in peacekeeping operations under the auspices of the UN.

Improving the activities of the ombudsman institution in Kazakhstan and the possibility of introducing it into the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan requires scientific research on this issue. It is necessary to research the world and domestic history of the development of the ombudsman institution on the whole, generally accepted international standards in the field of human rights protection. The most relevant is a historical and comparative comprehensive study of the effectiveness in the work of national ombudsmen of general competence, institutions of specialized ombudsmen at the global and domestic levels. On this basis, there will be the implementation of a science-based, balanced and careful approach for planning a model of the Kazakh military ombudsman.

On the basis of modern achievements of foreign and domestic historical and socio-humanitarian sciences, there is an urgent need to develop the fundamental principles, forms and methods of work of the military ombudsman institution, enshrined in the Regulations on the military ombudsman of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Therefore, what is achievable by predictive determination of the goals of proposed innovation, effective work in the conditions of the political and legal system of the Republic of Kazakhstan, its specifics, consequences of creation and functioning.

Thus, one of the trends in the modern military states development is the introduction of the institution of a military ombudsman in order to suppress official abuses of the military authorities and implement a democratic civilian control over the army. It should be noted that at present, the topical issues about the activities of the Ombudsman are not fully and comprehensively considered in the domestic science. The institution of the military ombudsman is studied for the first time in the framework of this dissertation. In view of the aforesaid, it is stated that the

presence, combination of these factors and circumstances, determine the choice of topic and the relevance of this research.

Purpose of the research – on the basis of historical and comparative analysis experiencing the formation and development of the ombudsman institution, to work out a scientifically based version of the model of the Kazakh military ombudsman.

Research objectives:

1. Based on historical and comparative analysis in the development of the ombudsman institution to reveal the specifics of modern models of the ombudsman and identify the characteristics of specialized ombudsman institutions in the world.

2. Revealing the history of formation of the ombudsman institution in the Republic of Kazakhstan, analyzing the activities of the national ombudsman institution of general competence and specialized ombudsmen, to find out the problems and determine the prospects for the development of the Kazakh national ombudsman institution.

3. Defining the reasons of origin of the institution of the military ombudsman in different countries in the world, to identify modern models of ombudsman institutions for the armed forces, to find the ways of implementation of a military ombudsman in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Object of the research - Ombudsman institution.

Subject of the research - The institution of the military ombudsman and the ways of its implementation in Kazakhstani army.

The chronological framework of the research covers the period from the second half of the 18th century, from the origin of the ombudsman institution in Sweden up to December 29, 2021 (signed the Law "On the Commissioner for Human Rights" by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan).

Methodological bases and research methods.

The theoretical and methodological basis of the research work is a dialectical historical analysis of the knowledge of social development, the classical principles of science, historicism and objectivity, which make it possible to show the relationship between various processes and phenomena related to the origin, formation and implementation of the ombudsman institution into the state political system.

The phenomenon and uniqueness of the ombudsman is determined by the fact that it is an integral effect, which can equally be considered as a political, legal and sociological institution which demands a dynamic development as part of the modernization of the Kazakhstani socio-political system.

Accordingly, in order to consider this phenomenon and explore it in an appropriate methodological way, it is necessary to base on several fundamental universal paradigms and scientific approaches characteristic of the entire spectrum of the social sciences and humanities, such as: national-state, civilizational, informational and ideological paradigms, military-strategic, social activity, dynamic and country studies approaches.

The methodological value of the paradigms and approaches we have chosen lies in the fact that they define a framework of a conceptual base, starting from

which it is possible to analyze the entire set of socio-political factors, including the military one. These paradigms and approaches completely affect the research field of the military history; therefore, it seems to be the most appropriate to use, first of all, the methodological arsenal of military history science to study the problems in the development of the military ombudsman institution.

From this point of view, the methodological basis of the research being conducted is based on the idea of the multidimensionality and diversity of historical and military-historical processes, sustained on a strict adherence to the principles of historicism, objectivism, concreteness and rationalism. At the same time, the principle of historicism makes it possible to follow the dynamics in the process of origin, formation and development of the ombudsman institution at the global and domestic levels. Due to this fact, it was possible to represent the institution of the military ombudsman as an element of the military-historical process deserving a thorough attention.

The conceptual basis of the study is the theory of modernization, which includes a comprehensive analysis of historical, political, legal, sociological, military and administrative transformations as interdependent processes aimed at the transition of Kazakhstani society and the Armed Forces to a new and higher level of development.

In the research work on the chosen theme, historical, comparative and institutional methodological approaches were used as the main ones, on the basis of which the main patterns in the ombudsman institution development were identified and compared. In the most part of the dissertation was used an interdisciplinary approach, resulting from the various aspects of the ombudsmen's problems.

The methodological basis of the dissertation is the total and combined application of general scientific and historical methods, as well as the methods of the military history and other military sciences. The historical method made it possible to identify patterns and forms of their implementation in the development of the ombudsman institution. On its basis, the necessary arguments were found by analyzing some historical events and facts. A systematic approach based on the principles of general systems theory made it possible to synthesize aspects of various scientific knowledge related to the problems of the ombudsman: history, political science, sociology, military affairs, etc. The sociological method made it possible to reflect the attitude of various social and ethnic groups to the policy pursued by the state, position of state structures, civil society and the population in relation to the institution of the ombudsman. The institutional method made it possible to identify its certain legal norms of national and international law in the field of protecting human rights and freedoms. In order to comply with the scientific and logical sequence in the process of research, a prominent role is given to socio-philosophical analysis, logical methods of cognition (deduction, induction, analogy, statistics and dialectical system analysis).

The core applied methods and techniques of the research are military-historical methods. The use of a country-specific approach while researching the history of the ombudsman institution in particular and the military ombudsman

itself predetermined the leading role of the historical-comparative method, carried out by comparing various historical, military-political phenomena, processes and legal acts adopted in different historical eras and in different countries. The historical-genetic method made it possible to research logically all the characteristics, functions and changes of the ombudsman institution in the process of its historical formation. Applying the historical-typological method, the classification of the process of evolutionary development of ombudsman institutions was implemented. The historical system-defined method helped to reveal the internal mechanisms of functioning and development of the research subject. On the basis of the ideographic method, it was possible to describe the historical events and phenomena associated with the origin of the ombudsman institution, to reproduce the historical conditions and factors influencing the military aspect on its formation. The problem-chronological method made it possible to reflect the dynamics of the origin and popularization of the ombudsman institution in a strict time sequence. Adhering to this method, it was possible to research the phenomenon of the ombudsman institution as a whole and to generalize the historical experience of the functioning of various types and patterns of the ombudsman institution. Each section of the dissertation contains a summary table of the historical and chronological phased development of the ombudsman institutions at the world level – the 1st section, at the domestic level – the 2nd section and at the level of the Armed Forces – the 3rd section.

All these facts allow solving the set scientific problems at the theoretical level and achieving all necessary results.

The originality and distinctive feature of the research is that within the framework of the historical orientation, not only theoretical provisions and conclusions are distinguished, but also a prognostic task is carried out, ensuring its practical significance. In the course of the research, the forecast was made by applying combined predictive modeling using statistical methods based on the analysis of the dynamic characteristics of the subject, such as extrapolation, similarity model and others.

The modeling method in this research was carried out on the basis of researching the historical and modern experience of various models of the ombudsman institution. Thus, it is taken as the basis, modeling represents the development of a sample of the research subject by moving from objective being to a theoretical image, and then to the creation of a dynamic picture of a cognizable objects. In this case, this sample acts as the analogue of a real socio-political object and is based on the analysis of the evolution in the development of the ombudsman institution at the national and international levels.

Scientific novelty. For the first time in the military-historical science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the institution of the ombudsman acts as the subject of the research and in the domestic social and humanitarian science, the institution of the military ombudsman is substantively examined.

The scientific novelty of the results of the research is concluded in improving the activities of the state and military authorities for the proper management of the human resource of the Kazakh army, ensuring the legal rights and freedoms of

military personnel, civilian personnel through the introduction of a new social and legal institution of the military ombudsman and the development of a scientifically based model of the Kazakh military ombudsman in of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

During the research work there was given the historical and comparative analysis in the development of the ombudsman institution; its modern samples are found out; the characteristic features and peculiarities of the specialized ombudsman institutions are identified.

It gives its own version in defining the entire institution of the ombudsman. Clarified historical stages in the formation of ombudsman institution in the Republic of Kazakhstan, also a new classification of the stages in the development of the domestic ombudsman is proposed. For comparison, the advantages and disadvantages of the HRC institutions and a specialized business ombudsman are shown. Besides, problematic issues are identified, the main contradiction in the activities of the domestic ombudsman institution is clarified and the prospects for the development of the national ombudsman institution are determined.

The dissertation shows the historical significance of the military aspect and the influence of the military factor on the processes related to the development of the ombudsman institution. The appearance of military ombudsmen at the present stage of military construction acts as a growing trend and a real historical process. The analysis for the reasons in the origin of the military ombudsman institution in different countries of the world was implemented, modern types and models of ombudsman institutions concerning the armed forces are identified.

Researching an international experience and policy documents for the modernization of Kazakhstani society the historical necessity of introducing a military ombudsman in the conditions of the Republic of Kazakhstan is justified.

The key result of the research work was the development of a challenging model: “The Guardian of Justice (Military Ombudsman) of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan”, which formulated the definition of this concept, defined the status, powers, appointment procedure, principles, directions, forms and methods of work.

For the real implementation of this model in practice, the fundamental document “Regulations on the Military Ombudsman of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan” has been developed, which determines the practical activities and place of the “Military Guardian of Justice” in the political and legal system of Kazakhstan Republic. Recommendations have been worked out for the accelerated introduction of the institution of the ombudsman in the Supreme Court in Kazakhstan Republic.

Due to the research, in the framework of achieving the set goal and solving specific problems, the following scientific results were achieved:

First scientific result is that owing to the research of historiography problem and the degree of development of this theme, it became possible to work out historical and comparative analysis of the ombudsman institution in world practice and to identify the positive experience of using the ombudsman abroad.

Second scientific result is related to the fact that on the basis of the historical analysis, the formation and development of the ombudsman institution in the Republic of Kazakhstan was surveyed and the problems and shortcomings of the national ombudsman institution were revealed and the prospects for its development were identified.

Third scientific result was the consequence of the fact that on the basis of researching the history and causes in the origin of a military ombudsman in different countries, their modern models were described and recommendations were developed for the introduction of a military ombudsman in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The main conclusions and provisions of the dissertation are structured in three points (in accordance with the sections of the research work).

For the first point:

1. The research made it possible to understand the historical purpose, distinctive features and peculiarities in the phenomenon of the political and legal system of the modern state and social structure, which is the institution of the ombudsman.

The exceptional features of the institution of the ombudsman are explained by historical, civilizational, cultural, political and legal processes, both of a universal human scale, together with the specifics of the development of a particular national state entity. The effectiveness of human rights activities, along with the implementation of the function of ensuring proper management and administration turned out to be so high that the development of the ombudsman institution acquired an irreversible and accelerating historical character.

2. Having originated in Sweden, at the beginning of the 19th century, as a result of significant political and socio-economic transformations, the institution of the ombudsman conditionally went by the following periods of its historical development:

1) The appointment and activities of the ombudsman in the two neighboring countries of Northern Europe, Sweden and Finland, they represent the first historical stage in the functioning of the ombudsman institution, which lasted until the middle of the 20th century, which is considered to be conditionally “Nordic”.

2) Development of ombudsman in the countries with a stable democratic system, starting with its establishment in 1954 in Denmark, then in the Anglo-Saxon countries and other European countries, and in all the continents until the 90s of the XX century, marks the second stage in the history of the development of the ombudsman institution. The model of ombudsman inherent in this stage of development is conditionally referred to as “classical”.

3) In parallel with the development of the “classical” ombudsman model in different countries of the world, the second process began to develop - the process of enshrining human rights values in international and national legislation. The institution of the ombudsman is beginning to take root in post-socialist states. It marked the beginning of the third, "newest" ("human rights") stage in the development of the ombudsman institution.

It is identified that the ombudsman for all the countries, except Sweden is an adopted institution. Moreover, development process of the ombudsman institution in developed democracies can be viewed as diffusion of innovations, in the countries of

Eastern Europe and Latin America - as an import of innovations and for some countries of the former USSR - rather as transferring of innovations;

3. Implementing the historical-comparative method and the use of neo-institutional approach, the main modern models of the ombudsman institution are identified:

1) according to the scope of the model of the ombudsman institution, there are general and specialized competence;

2) in terms of competence, powers and range of activities, three main models have been identified: control-imperative, control-recommendatory and human rights.

3) according to the identity of the relevant branch of government, parliamentary, executive and independent models of the ombudsman institution are distinguished;

4) depending on the type of political system and the degree of development processes in formation of civil society, there are "Nordic", "classical", "authoritarian", "post-authoritarian" models.

For each of these models, the research work reflects specific characteristics, directions and forms of activity. It provides the necessary and fundamental material for a deep and thorough researching the problems in development and improvement of the ombudsman institution in the Republic of Kazakhstan. It is the sample which must comply with international standards, thereby contributing to both the quality of the rights and freedoms of Kazakhstanis and the proper management of public officials in all spheres, including the military.

4. A trend has been identified; further improvement of the ombudsman institution by expanding vertically - appears at all levels of government and horizontally - follows the path of specialization.

The main direction of the modern development of the ombudsman institution is the origin of new types of specialized ombudsmen, which leads to a more efficient functioning of this institution and serves as additional guarantee for the timely protection and restoration of violated rights and freedoms of citizens, including various segments of the population, in various sectors and spheres of human activity.

5. The dissertation work shows the relevance and flexibility of the ombudsman idea on the basis of successful implementation in the countries with different history, geography, administrative and political structures. Based on the generalization of the historical experience of functional activities and the legislation of different countries, it was possible to identify the main areas of activity (functions) of the ombudsmen.

The conclusions in the first section, obtained in the course of the research, subsequently provided an opportunity to conduct an objective assessment of the current state of the domestic ombudsman institution and allow determining the prospects for its improvement. On the whole, all these facts contribute to the process of developing the ways to further improvement in the structure of public administration, ensuring its accessibility to citizens.

In the second point, a number of scientific results have been achieved, showing the particular importance of the functioning of an extrajudicial mechanism for protecting the rights and freedoms of a citizen on the basis of the ombudsman institution in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

6. The objective historical prerequisites for the origin of the political and legal foundations of the ombudsman institution in the Republic of Kazakhstan are found out.

The consistent introduction of the ideas of the ombudsman institution into the socio-political reality of the Republic of Kazakhstan is shown. The role and contribution of international human rights institutions, government agencies and prominent domestic and foreign figures in the development of the Kazakh national ombudsman institution is determined.

7. Five stages of the first period in the formation and establishment of the institution of the Commissioner for Human Rights in the Republic of Kazakhstan and the beginning of the transition process to the second stage, legislatively formalizing the compliance of the ombudsman institution in the Republic of Kazakhstan with Paris principles and world standards are identified. It is concluded, there is a necessity for further improvement in the legislative framework for functioning of the ombudsman institution, improve its political status and expand its powers in accordance with the international requirements.

It was found out that the main contradiction is the provisions declared by the Constitution on the observance of human rights are in conflict with the real situation. It is due to the incomplete compliance of human rights protection mechanisms with generally recognized international standards. The most important is the perception by all the subjects of human rights activities for the importance of the ombudsman institution and its subsidiary nature;

8. Particular attention is paid to the analysis of the organization of activities and the peculiarities in functioning of the national ombudsman of general competence and the specialized business ombudsman of the Republic of Kazakhstan. As a result, one can notice a significant organizational and staffing, material and financial advantage in ensuring the activities of the Ombudsman for Entrepreneurs and its more efficient and productive activities, information accessibility compared to the office of the Commissioner for Human Rights in the Republic of Kazakhstan. As a result, according to the international classification, the Ombudsman of General Competence of the Republic of Kazakhstan with a large advance in 2012 was assigned "status B" (observer), which is maintained to the present, then the institution of the Business Ombudsman of the Republic of Kazakhstan is noted by the experts as the most advanced in the CIS countries and is highly rated in the world level.

9. Prospects and further effective application of the ombudsman institution suggest:

1) inclusion in the text of the Constitution of an article clearly fixing the position of the ombudsman institution in political and legal system of the Republic of Kazakhstan;

2) adoption, by analogy with the Law on the HRC in the Republic of Kazakhstan, regulatory legal acts on specialized ombudsmen of the Republic of Kazakhstan;

3) empowering ombudsmen with the right to appeal directly to the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Kazakhstan and to initiate legislation, which will make up for the lack of the possibility of direct appeal of citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan to the agency of constitutional control;

10. In the process of researching the experience of institutional building of military structures for the protection of the rights of military personnel, it was revealed that there

is no centralized system in the organization of the military education of the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan and therefore the effective solution of the entire complex of social and legal issues is not fully ensured. It implies the importance of introducing the specialized bodies for the protection of the rights of personnel, which is mostly facilitated by the introduction of the institution of the military ombudsman.

The analysis of the history of education and the level of development of the military ombudsman in different countries of the world, given in the third section, led to the disclosure of the three main types of modern ombudsman institutions for the armed forces.

11. The first type is ombudsman institution created as part of the military organization of the state (integrated model). The second type is made up of universal institutions of ombudsman of general jurisdiction vested with the authority to oversee the armed forces. The third model is represented by non-departmental ombudsman institutions, whose jurisdiction extends only for the Armed Forces.

12. In the course of the research, it was possible to find out the principles, methods, features of national institutions of military ombudsman and the conditions conducive to their effective operation.

There is shown the role and contribution of the relevant international institutions which promote for the development of democratic processes related to the protection of the rights and freedoms of military personnel. As well as international organizations paying attention to the development of national institutions of the military ombudsman.

It makes possible to determine the significance for the armed forces of this institution, which acts as a significant auxiliary mechanism for protecting the rights and freedoms of military personnel, optimizing the military command and control system and providing feedback to the armed forces as a state body with civil society, the population of the country and specific citizens.

13. It should be noted that in the course of the research, the importance of introducing the institution of the military ombudsman based on the realities of the socio-political life of our country at the present stage, the relevance of initiating this process in connection with the course of the country's leadership towards reforming the political and legal system, in the light of the requirements of the Head of State on creating models, "providing timely protection of citizens' rights and appropriate for high international standards."

14. The conducted research allowed achieving the intended results and the goal. In the final subsection, the choice of the model of an independent specialized military ombudsman and the most acceptable for the political and legal system of the Republic of Kazakhstan is justified.

In the course of the research, the relevance of the initiative promotion of the process of introducing the institution of the military ombudsman is substantiated. It is justified from historical and rational point of view, the choice of the name «Guardian of Justice (Military Ombudsman) of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan".

The presented model reflects the political and legal status, competence and powers, fundamental principles, methods and forms of activity, the proposed staffing and organizational structure, its financial and budgetary justification and the requirements for the personality of the military ombudsman. Based on the research

work, the dissertator developed the "Regulations on the military ombudsman of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan", made recommendations for the highest bodies of the state and military administration on the implementation of the introduction of the institution of the military ombudsman in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

According to the results of the research work, there are four implementation acts approved:

-Deputy Chief of the General Staff – Chief Department educational and ideological work of the General Staff of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated from 18.02. 2022;

-Head of the Department of Military Education and Science of the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated from 27.01. 2022;

-Legal Department of the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated from March 4, 2022;

- Head of the Department of Social Disciplines and Pedagogy of the National Defense University on October 9, 2022.

The applicant has the copyright for the scientific work "Model of the military ombudsman of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (certificate № 16918 dated from April 23, 2021 RSE "National Institute of Intellectual Property" of the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan).

The following is submitted for defense:

1. The developed model of the Ombudsman of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The model will allow to introduce a new institution in the military sphere into the state-legal system, which ensures the improvement of the activities of the command staff of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan for personnel management, the guarantee of civil rights and freedoms of military personnel and the receipt by the President of the country - the Supreme Commander-in-Chief of the Armed Forces of operational information on the current state of affairs in the Kazakh army on the issue of constitutional human rights.

2. Regulations on the military ombudsman, the development of which creates the necessary regulatory and legal basis for the implementation and realization of the practical activities of the Institute "The Guardian of Justice" (Military Ombudsman) of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

3. Recommendations for state and military authorities on the implementation of the set of measures in order to accelerate the introduction of the ombudsman institution in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Theoretical and practical significance of the research.

Researching the problems of the ombudsman institution was for the first time described from the position of military historical science in order to solve the theoretical and practical problems of military construction, improve the activities of the state and military administration, based on the priority of the human factor in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan. What makes a certain contribution for the further development of the military and humanities, as well as a number of other branches of knowledge, such as the history of the state and military administration, the history of state and law, political science and sociology.

The materials of the dissertation work can be used for further more in-depth research the problems of the ombudsman institution, both in general and military ombudsman in particular, for the preparation of textbooks, special courses and seminars on the history of the state and law of Kazakhstan, the history of military development, the sociology of military management and other humanitarian disciplines.

From the practical point of view, as a result of the research work, a scientifically proved basis has been created for the introduction of the institution of the military ombudsman in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the case of a positive decision, the model proposed in the dissertation «The Guardian of Justice » and the Regulations on the military ombudsman will become the basis for the introduction of the independent specialized military ombudsman in the Republic of Kazakhstan. The implementation of the proposed recommendations at the level of the highest state bodies and the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan will ensure an accelerated process of making the strategically important decision to strengthen the country's defense capability.

On the whole: the analytical work carried out made it possible to define the ombudsman institution as a political, legal, social phenomenon and a dynamically developing historical process. In the course of the research work, it was possible to represent the institution of a military ombudsman as an element of the military-historical process which deserves a very serious attention.

It is succeeded scientifically to reflect one of the trends in the modern military construction of states is the introduction of the military ombudsman institution as additional mechanism for protecting the rights and freedoms of the personnel of the Armed Forces, the instrument for suppressing official abuses by military command and control bodies and implementing democratic civil control over army.

Therefore, in the dissertation, the position on the establishment of a specialized independent institute of the military ombudsman of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan is consistently defended. Which will certainly improve the parameters of the moral and psychological factor of the strategic deterrence of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan, strengthen the confidence of civil society and the population of the country in the activities of military command and control will be the most important factor in resolving issues of human rights and freedoms in the army and optimizing public administration in the defense sphere.

Conclusions and provisions of the dissertation as an integral and completed research work with a specific scientific and applied result are significant for the development of an important area of military-historical science of Kazakhstan, as the history of the state and military administration, as well as for the development of human capital assets in the framework of further military organization.

Analysis of scientific publications of the applicant on the theme of the dissertation.

As part of the research work, directly on the theme of the dissertation, the doctoral candidate published 16 scientific works: 15 articles, 8 of them were published in the publications recommended by the Committee of the CCS of the MES RK and 3 of them are from Higher Attestation Commission of the Russian Federation. The monograph was published: Lukmanov R.N., Zheksenbinov B.N. "Conceptual

provisions for the development of ideological work in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan", which presents the author's draft of the Concept of ideological work in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan, where it is proposed to introduce the institution of the military ombudsman. The total volume of scientific works of the applicant on the issues and problems of the research work is 18.3 printed sheets.

The following publications were independently prepared by the doctoral student:

1)"The history of the formation of the ombudsman institution in the Republic of Kazakhstan "-Military-theoretical magazine "Bagdar" ("Orientir") № 1, - Nur-Sultan, 2020. - p.83-87. (0.3 p.s)

2)"Modern models of the ombudsman institution" - Scientific and educational journal "Khabarshysy" ("Vestnik") № 1, - Nur-Sultan, 2020. -p. 174-179 (0.4 p.s)

3)"Model of the military commissar (ombudsman) of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan" - Scientific and educational journal "Khabarshysy" ("Vestnik") № 2, - Nur-Sultan, 2021. - p.202-205 (0.25 p.s)

4) The Institute of Independent Specialized Military Ombudsmen: the experience of foreign countries - The military-theoretical journal "Bagdar" ("Orientir ") № 2, - Nur-Sultan, 2021. - p.49-53 (0.3 p.s)

5) Application of the methodological foundations of military-historical science in the research of the ombudsman institution - Scientific and methodological journal "The World of Education - Education in the World". - M: 2022. - № 1(85) (0.6 p.s).

6) Conceptual views on the organization and conduct of ideological work in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan - "Prospects for the development of ideological (educational) work, taking into account the features of modern information and psychological confrontation (struggle)" / MNPK materials. - Nur - Sultan, 2019 - p.17-21 (0.3 p.s).

7) The historical significance of the introduction of the institution of the military ombudsman in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan - history and modernity, problematic issues and ways to improve" / MNPK materials. - Nur - Sultan, 2020 - RD - p. 91-93. (0.25 p.s).

8) Fundamental principles and approaches to the formation of the institution of the military ombudsman - history and modernity, problematic issues and ways to improve" / mat. MNPK. - Nur - Sultan, 2020 - RD - p.94-96 (0.25 p.s).

The total volume of the publications is 2.35 printed sheets.

In co-authorship, the doctoral student published 8 scientific articles and one scientific publication in the form of a monograph:

- in co-authorship with the research supervisor -Mukhamedzhanova S.Sh.-2 publications:

1. History of the development of the Ombudsman Institute - Scientific and educational journal "Khabarshysy" ("Vestnik") № 1, - Nur-Sultan, 2020. - p. 132-136 (0.3 p.l). At the same time, the personal contribution of the doctoral student for the work is 70% or 0.21 p.s.

2. Problems and prospects for the development of the Kazakh National Ombudsman Institute. - Scientific and educational journal "Khabarshysy" ("Vestnik ")

№ 2, - Nur-Sultan, 2021. – p. 213-216 (0.25 p.l). The personal contribution of a doctoral candidate for the work is 70% or 0.18 p.s.

- in co-authorship with research supervisor Martynov A.A. - 2 publications:

1. The history of the development of the military ombudsman and the prospects for its implementation in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan - Military-theoretical magazine "Bagdar" ("Orientir") № 1, - Nur-Sultan, 2020. - p.77-83 (0.44 p.s.) The personal contribution of a doctoral candidate for the work is 70% or 0.31 p.s.

2. International standards in the field of protection of the rights of military personnel and the role of the military ombudsmen in their provision - Military-theoretical magazine "Bagdar" ("Orientir ") № 2, - Nur-Sultan, 2021.- p.17-21(0.3 p.s). The personal contribution of a doctoral student for the work is 70% or 0.21 p.s.

In co-authorship with the master Imangozhin B.M. there is the article:

1. The Institute of Ombudsman as a mechanism for implementing the installation of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the construction of the "Hearing State" - Scientific and methodological journal "The World of Education - Education in the World". - M: 2022. - № 4 (84). pp. 129-134 (0.44 p.l). The personal contribution of a doctoral student for the work is 80% or 0.35 p.s.

In co-authorship with the master Abuov E.A. there is the article:

1. Military-legal aspect of educational and ideological work in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan - "Internauka": scientific journal - № 21 (197). Part 2. - M.: Ed. Internauka, 2021. - p.66 -69 (0.3 p.l). The personal contribution of a doctoral student for the work is 80% or 0.24 p.s.

In co-authorship with PhD Zheksenbinov were published 2 scientific articles on the theme of the dissertation and published one monograph:

1. "Military aspect in the process of origin and development of the institution of ombudsman" - Scientific and methodological journal "The world of education - Education in the world." - M: 2022. - № 1 (85) (0.5 p.l). The personal contribution of a doctoral student for the work is 60% or 0.18 p.s.

2. "Social and legal aspects of the conceptual foundations of ideological work in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan" - "history and modernity, problematic issues and ways to improve" / MNPK materials. - Nur - Sultan, 2020 - RD - p.97-100 (0.3 p.l). The personal contribution of a doctoral student for the work is 60% or 0.18 p.s.

Totally, the personal contribution of a doctoral student for the publication of the articles is 1.98 p.s.

The personal contribution of the applicant in writing the monograph: "Conceptual provisions for the development of ideological work in the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan" - Nur-Sultan: NDU, 2021. - 207 p. is more than 50% or 6.7 p.s.

Thus, the total volume of scientific works of the applicant on the theme of the dissertation work is 18.3 p.s., personal contribution is 11.3 p.s., while in the publication of the scientific articles - 4.6, the publication of one monograph - 6.7.